

The Honorable Joe Barton, Chairman  
Committee on Energy and Commerce  
The Honorable Ed Whitfield, Chairman  
Subcommittee on Oversight and Investigations  
2125 Rayburn House Office Building  
U.S. House of Representatives  
Washington, DC 20515

Friday, July 15, 2005

Dear Chairman Barton and Chairman Whitfield,

As scientists with expertise relevant to the understanding of Earth's changing climate, we are writing to help inform the inquiry you are conducting on the work of Drs. Michael Mann, Ray Bradley, and Malcolm Hughes. We understand that as a representative of the American people, you have a responsibility to inform yourself and your colleagues about scientific knowledge that is relevant to policy decisions. However, we are deeply concerned about your approach and we respectfully submit the following clarifying context.

In your letters of June 23, 2005, to these scientists, you state, "We open this review because this dispute surrounding your studies bears directly on important questions about the federally funded work upon which climate studies rely." In fact, the specific findings of Mann et al. constitute only one item among literally thousands of pieces of evidence that have contributed to the present consensus on the serious nature of climate change. While the 2001 report of the Intergovernmental Panel on Climate Change (IPCC) highlighted this work as a useful *illustration* of our understanding of the impact of fossil fuel-related emissions on climate change, in no way does the report suggest that it is an essential element of that understanding. This understanding has been developed over many years from many diverse lines of inquiry.

There are legitimate areas of scientific debate over the best methodologies to apply in reconstructing historic temperatures, as there are in many topics of current scientific interest. However, the essential points of the Mann et al. study—that the late twentieth century likely included the warmest decades in the last millennium—are supported by numerous other studies. We refer the committee to the full reports by the IPCC, the 2001 review of the Third Assessment report by the U.S. National Academy of Sciences, and the June 7 statement from the NAS and other leading science academies for balanced assessments of the current state of the science.

We also note that much of the information that you have requested from the scientists involved is unrelated to the stated purpose of your investigation. Requests to provide all working materials related to hundreds of publications stretching back decades can be seen as intimidation—intentional or not—and thereby risks compromising the independence of scientific opinion that is vital to the preeminence of American science as well as to the flow of objective advice to the government.

We welcome your interest in the science of climate change and hope that as a community, we can help your committee shape public policy in the light of the best available scientific knowledge.

Respectfully,

Michael Bender  
Professor  
Department of Geosciences  
Princeton University  
Princeton, New Jersey  
Member, National Academy of Sciences

Robert W. Corell  
Senior Fellow  
AMS Policy Program  
American Meteorological Society  
Washington, DC  
Chair  
Arctic Climate Impact Assessment

Christopher B. Field  
Director  
Department of Global Ecology  
Carnegie Institution of Washington  
Stanford, CA  
Member, National Academy of Sciences

James E. Hansen  
Director  
National Aeronautics and Space Administration  
Goddard Institute for Space Studies  
Columbia University Earth Institute  
New York City, NY  
Member, National Academy of Sciences

John P. Holdren  
Teresa and John Heinz Professor of Environmental Policy  
Harvard University  
Cambridge, MA  
Director, Woods Hole Research Center  
President-Elect American Association for the Advancement of Science  
Member, National Academy of Sciences, National Academy of Engineering,  
and American Academy of Arts and Sciences

Jean Lynch-Stieglitz  
Associate Professor  
School of Earth and Atmospheric Sciences  
Georgia Institute of Technology  
Atlanta, Georgia

Paul A. Mayewski  
Professor  
Department of Earth Sciences  
Director  
Climate Change Institute  
University of Maine  
Orono, ME

James J. McCarthy  
Agassiz Professor of Oceanography  
Department of Earth and Planetary Sciences  
Department of Organismic and Evolutionary Biology  
Harvard University  
Cambridge, MA

Michael B. McElroy  
Gilbert Butler Professor of Environmental Studies  
Division of Engineering and Applied Sciences  
Department of Earth and Planetary Sciences  
Harvard University  
Cambridge, MA

Mario Molina  
Professor  
Department of Chemistry and Biochemistry  
Center for Atmospheric Sciences  
Scripps Institution of Oceanography  
University of California, San Diego  
San Diego, CA  
Member, National Academy of Sciences  
Nobel Prize in Chemistry, 1995

Raymond T. Pierrehumbert  
Professor  
Department of Geophysical Sciences  
University of Chicago  
Chicago, IL

Alan Robock  
Distinguished Professor  
Department of Environmental Science  
Rutgers University  
New Brunswick, NJ  
Fellow, American Meteorological Society

William H. Schlesinger  
James B. Duke Professor of Biogeochemistry  
Dean  
The Nicholas School of the Environment and Earth Sciences  
Duke University  
Durham, NC  
Past President, Ecological Society of America, 2003-04  
Member, National Academy of Sciences

Gavin Schmidt  
Research Scientist  
National Aeronautics and Space Administration  
Goddard Institute for Space Studies  
Columbia University Earth Institute  
New York City, NY

Paul Shepson  
Director  
Purdue Climate Change Research Center  
Purdue University  
West Lafayette, IN

Susan Solomon  
National Oceanic and Atmospheric Administration  
Boulder, CO  
Recipient, National Medal of Science, 1999  
Member, National Academy of Sciences

Eric Steig  
Associate Professor  
Department of Earth and Space Sciences  
University of Washington  
Seattle, WA

Pieter Tans  
Chief Scientist  
Climate Monitoring and Diagnostics Laboratory  
National Oceanic and Atmospheric Administration  
Boulder, CO  
Fellow, American Geophysical Union

Lonnie G. Thompson  
Distinguished Professor  
Department of Geological Sciences  
Research Scientist  
Byrd Polar Research Center  
The Ohio State University  
Columbus, OH  
Recipient, Tyler Prize, The World Prize for Environmental Achievement, 2005  
Member, National Academy of Sciences

Donald J. Wuebbles  
Department Head and Professor  
Department of Atmospheric Sciences  
University of Illinois at Urbana-Champaign  
Urbana, IL  
Chair, American Geophysical Union's Executive Board of Heads and Chairs

cc:

Honorable John D. Dingell, Ranking Member, Energy and Commerce Committee  
Honorable Bart Stupak, Ranking Member, Oversight and Investigations Subcommittee

Honorable Cliff Stearns  
Honorable Charles Pickering, Jr  
Honorable Charles Bass  
Honorable Greg Walden  
Honorable Michael A. Ferguson  
Honorable Michael C. Burgess  
Honorable Marsha Blackburn  
Honorable Diana L. DeGette  
Honorable Janice D. Schakowksy  
Honorable Jay Inslee  
Honorable Tammy Baldwin  
Honorable Henry A. Waxman

Honorable Sherwood L. Boehlert, Chairman, House Science Committee  
Honorable Bart Gordon, Ranking Member, House Science Committee